

## **ACCESS, BOUNDARIES AND COOPERATION: AN INTRODUCTION**

by David K. Twigg, Florida International University  
and Gaspare M. Genna, University of Texas at El Paso

Canada has been and is currently the largest trade partner of the United States. The North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) sought to increase trade among these two partners, broadening the enterprise embodied in the Canada-United States Free Trade Agreement (CUSFTA) into a trilateral partnership, lowering trade barriers among Canada, the United States and Mexico. As trade and cooperation increase it might be expected that further efforts at integration, including easier labor exchanges, would result. Robert A. Pastor reports that although few Mexicans, Canadians or Americans see themselves as only "North Americans," a significant minority perceives national *and* continental identity:<sup>1</sup>

Mexican	27
Canadian	31
American	41

In 2000, 76 percent of Canadians and 68 percent of Mexicans perceived the United States favorably.<sup>2</sup> Then, less than eight years after NAFTA's 1994 initiation and prior to its full implementation, the terrorist attacks of September 11, 2001 altered the way governments and citizens view cooperation, borders and security.

Border security has increased, with the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, in response to its mandate from Congress, issuing more stringent passport requirements, building fences along the Mexican border and increasing enforcement efforts on the U.S. perimeter. The smuggling of people, drugs and other contraband has continued and North Americans, among others, are more aware of and concerned about the implications. If borders are insecure, if people can come across without screening and illegal shipments transit borders regularly, terrorists might also cross them with impunity. As a result, officials and candidates for elected office have become more skeptical about free trade arrangements and immigration. Trust among the NAFTA partners has waned. The securitization of U.S. policy requires the governments of Canada and Mexico to step up their border security in order to maintain their historically easy access to U.S. markets.

The Mexican government strengthened its fight against illicit drug trafficking and violence within Mexico erupted as ruthless drug cartels fought back and battled each other. This violence threatens to cross into the U.S. and even into Canada. The Merida initiative provides financial support to the Mexican government. Although stronger police and military activity confront drug cartels within Mexico, trafficking of drugs and humans continues, illegal operations shift to areas which have not yet increased vigilance against increasing levels of criminal activity and criminal groups step up competition with each other with increasingly brutal violence. Seeking security for themselves and their families, Mexicans migrate north, not always with official permission.

At the April 13, 2011 meeting of the House of Representatives Committee on Foreign Affairs' Subcommittee on the Western Hemisphere, Subcommittee Chair Connie Mack stated that his top priorities were "freedom, security and prosperity."<sup>3</sup> According to Mack, the situation in Mexico threatened to turn that country into a failed state, and only about \$300 million of the \$1.1 billion appropriated for the Merida initiative had been delivered to Mexico.<sup>4</sup> This high level of concern about the current and future condition of Mexico highlights the problems of any further North American integration, but the attention and assistance provided by Mexico's northern neighbors also indicates that Mexico's current problems may yet be solvable.

To address timely issues of cooperation, migration and security in North America, the Jack D. Gordon Institute for Public Policy and Citizenship Studies at Florida International University (FIU), partnering with the University of Texas at El Paso and scholars from Canada, Mexico and the United States, implemented the international North American Security Colloquium Access, Boundaries and Cooperation: The ABCs of North American Security in Miami on February 24, 2012. The colloquium presented the results of research on various aspects of cooperation and securitization, including energy security, migration, trade and economic cooperation and protection against other security threats. This Digital Commons site constitutes the Colloquium Proceedings of the research presented at the Colloquium. The project advances the existing research base by exploring the questions: What effects are migration and security having on North American cooperation, and what effects are the cooperative efforts having on migration and security?

"Security" is not limited to issues of military or police protection, but includes energy and human security. These

questions thus require analysis from different perspectives and these are here provided by researchers from all NAFTA partner countries. The implications of this research project have policy relevance for North American development, security, competitiveness, cooperation and even identity. This includes implications for each country individually, collectively, and bilaterally (Canada-U.S., Canada-Mexico, and U.S.-Mexico).

The Jack D. Gordon Institute for Public Policy and Citizenship Studies, part of the FIU College of Arts and Sciences' School of International and Public Affairs, partnered with University of Texas at El Paso to administer a North American Mobility Program in partnership with universities in Canada (Carleton University in Ottawa and University of Alberta in Edmonton) and in Mexico (Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas [CIDE] in Mexico City and Universidad Autónoma de Nuevo León [UANL] in Monterrey, Nuevo León) to enable students to study and conduct research for a semester in a partner country and to develop university curricula for the study of North America. We are grateful for this continuing partnership. The Mobility Program was funded for four years by the US Department of Education under the Fund for the Improvement of Postsecondary Education (Grant #P116N080010).

We were awarded a small grant from the Canadian Embassy and received additional support from several sources, including Carleton University, CIDE, UANL, the FIU School of International and Public Affairs and the FIU Latin American and Caribbean Center to enable the successful implementation of the Colloquium. This support assured the success of the Colloquium project.

The Honorable Juan Miguel Gutiérrez Tinoco, Consul General of Mexico in Miami since 2007, welcomed the Colloquium participants and attendees. He described the importance of the relations between Mexico and its North American partners and thanked the participants for their work to further the bonds among the three partner nations. We are certainly grateful for his involvement with our project.

The Honorable Louise Léger, appointed to the post of Consul General of Canada in Miami in 2009, addressed the participants during lunch. She discussed the efforts to expedite trade between the United States and Canada and migration and citizenship issues within Canada impacting Mexican immigrants in the northern partner nation. Consul General Léger and her consulate staff, especially Beth Richardson, Georgette Pepper, Peter Taylor, and Megan Kopistecki, were very supportive of our efforts to organize and implement this Colloquium, and we are eternally indebted.

Our first panel explored issues of democracy within North America and the first of our papers initiated this discussion. Julián Castro-Rea's *The Mess They Made: How Conservatism Wrecked North America* details an alternative explanation for why the promise of integration and cooperation inherent in NAFTA faltered after the terror attacks of September 11, 2001, and has been replaced by "thicker borders," lack of economic coordination in the face of crisis and stronger nationalism leading to less trust of others.

Castro-Rea identifies commonalities of conservative political parties in the three partner states, Mexico's National Action Party (PAN), the Canadian Conservative Party and the Republican Party in the U.S., which have all largely formed around market-oriented business models in conjunction with "religion-inspired" social conservatives. Policies on migration, trade and general security have been similarly driven by these conservative parties while they have been in government, but have been influenced by often conflicting constituent expectations leading to, for instance, reduced taxes for business and upper-income individuals and significantly increased security-related expenditures.

In *Superfluousness, Institutional Failure and Immigration: Citizenship and Human Rights in Conflict in North America* Emma R. Norman uses Arendt's rivalry between human and citizenship rights to show how some groups are falling between the cracks in the modern globalizing world. We can see examples of that in the arguments against undocumented immigrants within the U.S. debates over the proposed Dream Act, in the 1994 rafting crisis when tens of thousands of Cubans and Haitians were taken to and held at Guantanamo Bay and of course in the ongoing legal battles over suspected terrorists held at Guantanamo-stateless non-citizens with limited rights neither charged nor released. Norman shows how the unequal relations among the three North American partners and increasingly hostile conflicting international, national and sub-state laws institutionalize the, if not "stateless" then "outlawed," "unwanted," or "unclaimed," status of migrants who cannot legally enter a more prosperous North American neighbor state, and any who do illegally enter the neighbor state must live underground and avoid temporarily returning home.

David Mayer-Foulkes and Raúl Garcia-Barrios specifically explore Mexican issues in *Democracy and Development for Mexico*. Mexico's shift to join GATT and open its economy, as well as to create a more open competitive democratic system, was expected to create more space for human rights and enable strong economic growth. These expectations have not been fully realized. Mayer-Foulkes and Garcia-Barrios define separate economic parameters and

suggest a synthesis of neoclassical, Keynesian, Marxist and Modern Economic Growth paradigms to emphasize individual rights and economic equality. Mexico, then, needs to continue its economic liberalization, but support it with policies that will enhance the ability of all to embrace technology, develop human capital and assure that ethical democratic power rises from the bottom of the socio-economic-political spectrum.

Gaspare M. Genna then tackles the complex but direct question: *What will it take to build a North American Community?* From this paper we see that transaction costs may have significant impact on regional integration. Transaction costs, in turn, are associated with compatibility between and among states. Compatibility and having a dominant partner are both important for integration. In North America power asymmetry certainly exists, but Mexico's economic imbalance with its partners creates a situation in which the northern partners need to perceive more equal conditions before further integration is likely.

The Colloquium's second panel provided an important discussion of security in North America, which entails numerous aspects and is variously defined.<sup>5</sup> Labor and migration issues certainly impact on business and trade between and among the partner states of North America. Christina Gabriel and Laura Macdonald provide insights into Mexican labor within Canada in "*Domestic Transnationalism*": *Legal Advocacy for Mexican Migrant Workers' Rights in Canada*. A major effort to gain the right of organized labor representation for agricultural workers in Ontario by labor unions, currently prohibited, would have benefitted a significant number of temporary migrants as well as Canadians. The legal challenges worked their way to the Canadian Supreme Court using almost exclusively Canadian national and provincial laws to improve the lot of transnational workers.

Kimberly A. Nolan Garcia explores workers' issues in the U.S. and Mexico in *The Evolution of US-Mexico Labor Cooperation (1994-2010): The NAAALC Institutions and their Policy Challenges*. Garcia emphasizes the North American Agreement on Labor Cooperation, one of two "side agreements" that were essential in winning U.S. domestic support for the passage of NAFTA itself.<sup>6</sup> She shows that this agreement, although establishing new institutions to enhance labor cooperation between and among the North American partners, has failed to produce significantly improved labor cooperation.

*Organizing the Mexican Diaspora: Can it Strengthen North America Integration?* by Jane H. Bayes and Laura Gonzalez, describes the

development of the Consejo Consultivo del Instituto de los Mexicanos en el Exterior, established by Mexico to organize Mexicans living in Canada and the United States. The Mexican government perceives this organization as advisory but many of the "advisors" think they should be independent of the government, causing some friction and the creation of other, truly independent, organizations that in turn organize parts of the Mexican diaspora and link to other existing institutions to improve the lot of Mexicans living abroad.

Nielan Barnes then, in *What does the 2010 U.S. Health Care Reform Mean for Securing Immigrant Health in North America?* identifies the importance of health care for temporary migrants from the Global South working in countries of the North. In the U.S. governmental policies and financial shortfalls increasingly encourage employers to hire temporary workers, but provide little or no health care for those workers. State and local laws also impact on the ability of undocumented migrants to obtain needed services, and also discourage documented individuals from seeking services, including health care. Private, multi-national and organized labor efforts, Barnes contends, will become ever more important for migrants in obtaining health care.

Panel Three of the ABCs Colloquium provided a slightly eclectic group of security issues. Edward Glab's *North American Energy Security* detailed the issues surrounding energy and their implications for North America. Global energy consumption is expected to grow significantly, especially in developing countries. North America holds substantial reserves of natural gas and oil. Canada alone contains resources second only to Saudi Arabia and exports more oil to the U.S. than does Saudi Arabia. Glab argues that this trade can be increased, reducing the reliance on Venezuela and the Middle East. Mexico, too, exports significant quantities of oil to the U.S. and potentially has large untapped off-shore resources. Glab outlines several important strategies for enhancing energy security in North America.

Roberto Dominguez and Rafael Velásquez show, in *Obstacles for Security Cooperation in North America*, that differing perceptions of security exist within the three North American countries. The U.S. is more concerned with global threats due to its significant worldwide involvement. Mexicans perceive crime and the illicit drug trade as the greatest security threats, and Canadians see climate change as the biggest threat. Some U.S. constituencies are opposed to deepening security integration with Mexico because of domestic opposition to illegal immigrants and both Canada and

Mexico are concerned about losing sovereignty. Thus it is likely that bilateral security relations and policies will continue and implementation of a regional security approach remains for the distant future.

*Secure Borders and Uncertain Trade*, by Coral R. Snodgrass and Guy H. Gessner identifies increased problems for trade between Canada and the U.S. Manufacturers and other businesses experience supply chain delays because of increased border security implemented after September 11, 2001. Although trade remains significant—a substantial part is intra-firm trade of parts and subcomponents between subsidiaries—in conjunction with NAFTA's rule of origin documentation and reduced spending due to the slow recovery from the deep U.S. recession, Canadians are not visiting across the border as much and the percentage of trade with the U.S. vis-à-vis other countries has also seen some decline.

Finally, Eva Olimpia Arceo-Gómez investigates, in *Drug-Related Violence, Forced Migration and the Changing Face of Mexican Immigrants in the United States*, whether increases in homicide rates along the U.S. border in Mexico are affecting migration to the U.S. Comparing demographics from 2000 to 2010, Arceo-Gomez finds that Mexican migrants have become better educated, indicating that more business people and professionals are moving rather than unskilled laborers. More self-employed people are moving (not just to border states) while better educated individuals, and more women, are moving to border states. Thus the violence in Mexico is causing an erosion of human capital, something that North American policy-makers should consider.

We invite you to read the papers presented and to further explore the important topic of North American security and its various aspects. We would like to again thank our colleagues for participating in the ABCs Colloquium and for sharing their research. We also thank the sponsors that enabled the Colloquium to be a success: the FIU School of International and Public Affairs, the FIU Latin America and Caribbean Center, The University of Texas at El Paso, Carleton University, Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas, Universidad Autónoma de Nuevo León. Staff of the Jack D. Gordon Institute for Public Policy and Citizenship Studies worked diligently to arrange travel and accommodations and to take care of all the administrative details, and we deeply appreciate their efforts: Jose Cervantes, Luisa Martinez, Hector Cadavid and Chaka Ferguson. Last but certainly not least we gratefully acknowledge that the Colloquium was made possible with the assistance of the Government of Canada, avec l'appui du gouvernement du Canada.

---

<sup>1</sup> Pastor, Robert A. 2011. The North American Idea: A Vision of a Continental Future. New York: Oxford University Press. P.67.

<sup>2</sup> Ibid. p. 59.

<sup>3</sup> Mack, Connie. 2011. U.S. Printing Office. Hearing Before the Subcommittee on the Western Hemisphere of the Committee on Foreign Affairs, House of Representatives. Serial No. 112-30: April 13. <http://foreignaffairs.house.gov/112/65795.pdf>, accessed 6/25/2012. P. 1.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid. p. 2.

<sup>5</sup> Stevenson, Brian J.R. 1996. "Cooperative Security and Canada's Role in Inter-American Security Reform" in Natural Allies?: Canadian and Mexican Perspectives on International Security. H.P Klepak, Ed. Ottawa: Carleton University Press.

<sup>6</sup> For a detailed description of the importance of the side agreements in the U.S political milieu see Frederick W. Mayer. 1998. Interpreting NAFTA: The Science and Art of Political Analysis. New York: Columbia University Press.